Spawning coloration, female choice and sperm competition in the redside dace, *Clinostomus elongatus*

Jean-Marc J. Beausoleil a, Stéphanie M. Doucet a, Daniel D. Heath a,b, Trevor E. Pitcher a,*

a Department of Biological Sciences, University of Windsor, Windsor, Canada
b Great Lakes Institute of Environmental Research, University of Windsor, Windsor, Canada

A central aim of evolutionary biology is to understand how selection acts on traits in natural populations. For example, sexual selection acts on secondary sexual traits when there is variation in reproductive success associated with these traits, which arises from two mechanisms: intrasexual selection (male–male and female–female competition) and intersexual selection (e.g. female and male mate choice) (reviewed in Andersson 1994; Andersson & Simmons 2006). Although the importance of both of these mechanisms for the evolution of secondary sexual characters in males has been acknowledged, most researchers focus their attention on one or the other mechanism within the context of their study system. This can be problematic, however, because even though both mechanisms may operate at the same time, they do not necessarily act in the same direction (reviewed by Hunt et al. 2009). For example, the two mechanisms can reinforce each other, as in the western rainbow fish, *Melanotaenia australis*, and hissing cockroaches, *Gromphadorhina portentosa*, where male–male competition and female choice both act to favour large body size in males (Clark & Moore 1995a, b, c; Young et al. 2010). Alternatively, if sexual conflict is pronounced, one mechanism may oppose the other (reviewed in Arnqvist & Rowe 2005). In water striders, *Aquarius remigis*, for example, male–male competition appears to select for larger body size, whereas female choice appears to select against larger body size (Sih et al. 2002). As such, when differences in the relative strengths of the two mechanisms exist, the outcome for sexual selection will depend on an interaction between the magnitude and direction of each selective force (see Hunt et al. 2009). Differentiating between the effects of female choice and male–male competition within a mating system is therefore critical in order to better understand the relative contribution of the two mechanisms in the evolution of sexually selected traits.

A recent review of 83 studies (of 51 species) that investigated both male–male competition and female mate choice acting on an apparent sexually selected trait, male body size, found that in most cases selection was linear and that both mechanisms were more likely to be reinforcing rather than opposing (Hunt et al. 2009). However, the generality of these results is questionable because
although body size is commonly thought to be important in sexual selection, it is also a metric that is crucial in many other contexts (e.g. different life history stages) and is likely to be influenced by natural selection as well. As such, Hunt et al. (2009) suggest that there is a need for more empirical studies of both mechanisms that examine traits that are limited in expression to the adult stage and that have little relevance outside of courtship and mating, such as colourful male secondary sexual characters (e.g. Sneath 2003; Tarof et al. 2005). In addition to considering sexual traits other than body size, there is also a need to examine how both pre- and postcopulatory processes might affect the evolution of male secondary sexual characters. For example, if there is a relationship between male secondary sexual characters and sperm quality (Blount et al. 2001; Peters et al. 2004), postcopulatory sperm competition success by more ornate males might reinforce or oppose precopulatory female choice on male sexual traits. Predicting the directionality of the relationship between sperm quality metrics and sexual ornamentation is difficult because two different hypotheses make opposite predictions. The phenotype-linked fertility hypothesis (Sheldon 1994) suggests that male sperm quality and ornament elaboration will positively covary, whereas, the sperm competition hypothesis (Parker 1998) predicts a negative association between sperm investment and sperm quality and ornamentation related to mate acquisition. For example, in the poeciliid Poecilia reticulata, males with relatively more orange body colouration (a trait subject to precopulatory female choice: Magurran 1995; Pitcher et al. 2003) have more and faster sperm (Pitcher & Evans 2001; Locatello et al. 2006; Pitcher et al. 2007) and a paternity advantage because of artificial insemination of females with equal numbers of sperm from two competing males (Evans et al. 2003). Whereas, in Arctic char, Salvelinus alpinus, the most brightly coloured males (i.e. males with more intense red sexual ornamentation) have the lowest fertilization probability following artificial fertilization of female's eggs using equal numbers of sperm from two competing males (Liljedal et al. 2008).

In this study we used mate choice trials, spectral and sperm analysis, competitive in vitro fertilization and paternity assignment to examine factors affecting the evolution of a male secondary sexual character. We did this by quantifying prespawning female mate choice and postspawning male—male competition in the redside dace, Clinostomus elongatus. The redside dace is a small, externally fertilizing cyprinid native to headwater streams in the basins of the Mississippi River and Lakes Michigan, Huron, Erie and Ontario (Parker et al. 1988). Sexual selection has not been explored in this species, but the sexual dichromatism exhibited in sexually mature adults during the spawning season suggests that it may be present in this species’ mating system (Andersson 1994). Throughout the year, adult redside dace have pink coloration on their body just behind their head, but during the breeding season both sexes develop intense red spawning coloration. Based on a chemical test that identifies the presence of carotenoid pigments in animal tissues (McGraw et al. 2005) and preliminary high performance liquid chromatography analyses, the red spawning coloration is carotenoid based (T. E. Pitcher & K. McGraw, unpublished data). The red spawning coloration manifests itself as an intense red stripe extending from the opercula to below the dorsal fin or beyond (Fig. 1). Males appear to possess a larger area of more intensely red spawning coloration than females, although this has yet to be quantified. Throughout their range, redside dace, which become sexually mature at the age of 3 years (they can live to be 4 years old), spawn between mid-May and early June (Scott & Crossman 1988; Werner 2004). Like some other small minnows, redside dace typically parasitize gravel nests built by larger minnows or suckers such as creek chub, Semotilus atromaculatus. These nests are found just upstream or downstream of fast riffles in coarse sand or fine gravel. Redside dace leave the eggs to be guarded by the larger species and provide no parental care to their offspring. During spawning, males typically congregate in dense schools downstream from creek chub nests, with the females positioned on the outer regions of the school. Spawning typically begins when a female moves upstream towards a creek chub nest and is followed by up to six males (Koster 1939; T. E. Pitcher, unpublished data). During spawning, multiple males crowd around the female and release their sperm as she deposits her eggs into a gravel nest. Females carry between 400 and 1500 eggs, depending on their body size (Scott & Crossman 1998; Werner 2004). Spawning of eggs by females and sperm from multiple males can be repeated every few seconds for about 1 min, with several minutes often elapsing between each spawning bout. Unlike other minnows that have a lek-like mating system (e.g. European minnow, Phoxinus phoxinus, Jacob et al. 2009), behavioural observations of wild redside dace prior to spawning suggest that prespawning male—male competition plays a limited role in this mating system because males do not appear to defend territories or have consistent spawning hierarchies (T. E. Pitcher, personal observation). However, it is likely that postspawning intrasexual competition in the form of sperm competition, the competition between sperm of two or more males for the fertilization of ova (Parker 1970), is an important selective factor in this mating system. Recently, Pitcher et al. (2009a) documented significant intermale variance in sperm size and shape metrics (total sperm length, sperm head length, flagellum length and sperm head length to width ratio) for redside dace and also found positive relationships between these morphometric indices and sperm velocity. Because sperm velocity correlates with sperm competition success in many fish species (e.g. Gage et al. 2004), these findings suggest that male redside dace vary in their sperm competitive ability.

We examined the success of individual male redside dace in both pre- and postspawning sexual selection and related the success of males to a range of traits, including body size, spectral properties and size of the red spawning coloration, and sperm quality. Our first objective was to quantify sexual dimorphism in this species and to test whether females show preferences for sexually dimorphic male traits. Using mate choice trials in which females were allowed to choose between two males, we predicted that the degree of female preference for a particular male would increase as a function of the difference in phenotype between the two males; that is, females should be more responsive to more colourful (i.e. more ornamented) males. Our second objective was to examine postspawning male—male competition by using in vitro sperm competition trials to determine which sperm traits are important for competitive fertilization success and whether males that are more colourful possess these sperm traits. To accomplish this objective, we investigated the importance of sperm velocity, density and longevity with respect to competitive fertilization success by conducting in vitro fertilization trials using sperm from pairs of males and eggs from individual females. We then used
microsatellite markers to assign paternity to the offspring, estimate relative fertilization success (i.e. paternity) for each male and relate relative fertilization success to differences in sperm traits and ornamentation between competing males. Finally, we determined whether female choice and male–male competition favour the same or different male sexual traits, and thus whether pre- and postspawning sexual selection to reinforce or oppose each other, respectively.

METHODS

Study Species and General Field Methods

We captured redside dace in the wild during the spawning season from Rathburn Run in Wayne County, OH, U.S.A. (40°48.658′N, 082°01.400′W) between 28 May and 1 June 2008. Overall, 50 males and 22 females were captured using standard seining techniques. All males (N = 50) and a subset of females (N = 7) were used to test for sexual dimorphism among a suite of candidate phenotypic traits, including standard length and metrics of the red spawning coloration (hue, saturation, brightness and relative area (corrected for body area)). Forty-four of the males and all 22 females were used to examine which traits females preferred using dichotomous mate choice trials. Next, 45 of the males were used in comparisons of sexual ornamentation to sperm quality traits (sperm data were not available for five of the males). Finally, we captured an additional 27 redside dace (N = 18 males, 9 females) to determine which sperm traits are related to competitive fertilization success. We could not use the same males used to examine sexual ornamentation and sperm quality traits because of the need to expedite the eggs back from the field to the laboratory for immediate fertilization. We investigated the importance of sperm velocity, number and longevity with respect to fertilization success by conducting in vitro fertilization competitions using sperm from pairs of males and eggs from a single female. Next, we used microsatellite markers to assign paternity to the offspring, estimate relative fertilization success for each male, and then relate relative fertilization success to difference in sperm traits between competing males.

Female Choice Trials

Mate choice trials were conducted in a dichotomous choice Plexiglas tank in which the partitions were watertight and all sides of the tank were transparent with the exception of the wall separating the males, which was opaque to prevent male–male interactions (see Fig. 2). The tank was filled with stream water and placed on the bed of the stream from which individuals were collected, and was positioned so that there would be approximately even levels of light entering both male sections. Females were chosen haphazardly from those collected, and pairs of males were chosen by eye to have similar body size. A removable opaque partition was used to separate the female from the males for a 5 min acclimation period. The partition was then removed and 23 min behavioural trials were recorded using a digital camcorder (Sony Handycam DCR-SR200) with a polarized lens filter (Sony MC Circular PL) to reduce glare from the water surface. After individuals were used in the behavioural trials they were measured for a variety of potential secondary sexual characters and a milt sample was collected from each male (see Sperm Quality Measurements below).

Footage of the mate choice trials was reviewed and the total amount of time the female spent in the neutral and preference zones (see Fig. 2) was determined to the nearest second. Preference time with a male was determined as the time the female spent in the preference zone (dotted line in Fig. 2) on that male’s half of the tank when she was interacting with that male (approach and visual inspection of males by females was considered to be interaction). Time spent in the neutral zone was counted as not showing preference for either male. We examined female behavioural data in two ways: by comparing the number of times that a female spent more time with the more ornamented male (using a binomial test), and by using a preference function asking whether a female spent significantly more than 50% of the time with the more ornamented male (see Statistical Analyses below for details). Three behavioural trials were discarded because one male escaped from the tank and two females did not inspect either male during the duration of the trial.

Male and Female Phenotypic Measurements

At the completion of a behavioural trial, individuals were anaesthetized in a water bath containing 0.15 g/litre of MS-222. Next, each fish was immediately photographed with a ruler for scale using a digital camera (Canon PowerShot A570IS) and weighed to document the standard length (±0.1 cm), body mass (±0.001 g), condition (=(body mass (g))/(100)/(standard length (cm))))², the body area (mm²) and the area of red spawning coloration area (mm²; i.e. area of red integument pigmentation; see Fig. 1). The area of red spawning coloration and total body area were quantified for the right side of each individual using ImageJ analysis software (available at www.rsba.info.nih.gov/ij/) to calculate the relative area covered by red integument pigmentation (see Pitcher et al. 2003), hereafter referred to as residual red spawning coloration area.

The red spawning coloration was measured on the right side of the body for each of the males and a subset of females using reflectance spectrometry (see Figs 1, 3). The coloration of the red integument pigmentation was measured using an Ocean Optics reflectance spectrometer (USB-4000, detector range 200–1100 nm) and a xenon pulse lamp (PX-2, illumination range 220–750 nm) (see Pitcher et al. 2008b). Light was delivered to the sample area and the reflected light was transmitted to the spectrometer via a bifurcated fibre-optic probe (R-400-7-UV-VIS). The probe tip was encased in a matte-black rubber holder that excluded external light and maintained a fixed distance between the probe and the measurement surface. The system was calibrated using a white standard that reflects more than 97% of the wavelengths used in our analyses (Labsphere WS-1). Prior to collecting reflectance measurements, the body surface was wiped with a lint-free delicate
task wiper to remove excess water that could cause specular glare by reflecting incident light.

Reflectance was measured at one landmark position on the red spawning coloration (see Fig. 1), immediately behind the operculum (with the probe tip positioned so that the entire opening was on the red integument pigmentation and no light could enter through the operculum opening). One reading consisting of 20 consecutive measurements (averaged by the spectrometer operating software, OOIBase 32) was taken at the one landmark point on the red spawning coloration (see Fig. 3, Table 1). We used the program CLR (see Montgomerie 2008) to calculate three colorimetric variables to approximate the three dimensions of colour: hue, saturation and brightness. We calculated hue as the wavelength at which each reflectance spectrum reached 50% of its maximum value (Montgomerie 2006). We calculated saturation as the difference between maximum and minimum reflectance, divided by brightness (Montgomerie 2006). We calculated brightness as the average percentage reflectance across the entire spectrum; lower brightness values are indicative of increased pigmentation (Montgomerie 2006).

Sperm Quality Measurements

After reflectance measurements were completed, milt was collected from males by holding each one upside down and applying gentle pressure to the abdomen. The milt was then collected as it emerged using a pipetter and then placed in a 1.6 ml Eppendorf tube. Care was taken to prevent exposure of the milt to a cooler and transported back to the laboratory for further analysis. Eggs were kept in a cooler for transport back to the laboratory for sperm competition trials. Fin clips were collected from all adults and used for sperm quality assessment (see above for details) and sperm competition trials. Fin clips were collected from all adults and preserved in 95% ethanol for paternity assignment genotyping.

Sperm competition trials were conducted in the same small petri dishes that eggs were initially collected in. Males were paired so that the difference in storage time of their respective milt samples was minimized. We simultaneously applied 2 µl of milt from each of the two males to the same place in the egg mass (from one female) using standard seining techniques from the same stream. Males were paired so that the difference in storage time of their respective milt samples was minimized. We simultaneously applied 2 µl of milt from each of the two males to the same place in the egg mass (from one female) using standard seining techniques from the same stream. Males were paired so that the difference in storage time of their respective milt samples was minimized. We simultaneously applied 2 µl of milt from each of the two males to the same place in the egg mass (from one female) using standard seining techniques from the same stream.

Figure 3. Mean ± SE reflectance spectra (see text for details) for male (closed circles, N = 50) and female (open circles, N = 7) redside dace.
interior diameter, 2.5 cm tall sides) with bottoms covered with 400 μm mesh to allow water circulation around the eggs. These trays were then placed in a stand designed to hold them in the centre of the tank, above an airstone to ensure that highly oxygenated water would circulate around the eggs; water tension prevented the air bubbles from passing directly through the mesh, so the bubbles were moved to the side, leaving the eggs undisturbed. There were two such set-ups per rectangular tank, with an extremely fine mesh (150 × 150 μm) secured between them to prevent larvae from crossing between sides. Half-tank water changes were conducted at approximately 8 h intervals throughout rearing. Eyespots were visible to the naked eye approximately 24 h postfertilization, and larvae began to hatch approximately 48 h postfertilization. Fertilized eggs (that had visible eyespots) were collected from each family prior to hatching and prior to any mortality, which could affect the paternity estimates for each male in competition if the embryo viability of either male’s offspring differed (see Garcia-Gonzalez 2008). Offspring samples were preserved in 95% ethanol for subsequent DNA extraction.

DNA was extracted from adult fin clips (two males and one female per competition trial) and all of the larvae dissected from the available eggs. Fin clips or larvae were dried of ethanol and placed in 96 well plates with digestion buffer and proteinase K solution before being incubated at 37 °C and agitated gently overnight. Extraction was then performed using a Janus Automated Liquid Handling System (Perkin Elmer Life and Analytical Sciences, Dowers Grove, IL, U.S.A.) following the protocol of Elphinstone et al. (2003). Paternity of offspring was determined using four polymorphic microsatellite markers recently developed for redside dace (Pitcher et al. 2009c); RSD 42A (dinucleotide repeat motif), RSD-86 (dinucleotide repeat motif), RSD-92 (tetranucleotide repeat motif) and RSD-142 (tetranucleotide repeat motif). The loci were amplified using polymerase chain reaction with the following protocol: denaturation for 2 min at 95 °C, followed by 35 cycles of 30 s at 95 °C, 30 s annealing at 58 °C (53 °C for RSD-142), 30 s extension at 72 °C, then a final extension step of 2 min at 72 °C. Fluorescently labelled primers were used and the fragment sizes determined by polyacrylamide gel electrophoresis using a Licor 4300 DNA Analyzer system. Allele size was estimated using Gene Imager (version 4.05) software. In all cases we were able to identify alleles in the offspring that were diagnostic for paternity identification; thus, paternity was determined via both exclusion of one of the two possible males and positive inclusion of the other males. Paternity was assigned to an average of 27 offspring (range 10–51) for the nine sperm competition trials. Paternity was measured for each male by dividing the number of offspring he sired by the total number of offspring genotyped.

Statistical Analyses

Because the area of red spawning coloration on males was a function of their body area (Spearman correlation: \( r_s = 0.81, N = 50, P < 0.001 \)), the residual area of red spawning coloration was used as an index of how much red spawning coloration males possessed controlling for body size. We estimated the residual area of red spawning coloration using the least squares residuals of the regression of the log of red coloration area on the log of the total area of the body. We used a MANOVA to examine which of the candidate phenotypic traits (standard length, body mass, condition, residual area of red spawning coloration, and the hue, saturation, brightness of the red spawning coloration) showed significant sexual dimorphism or dichromatism. Next, we assayed whether females showed a preference for any of the significant sexually dimorphic traits using standard tests associated with dichotomous choice trials, binomials for the number of females that spent more time with the more ornamented male, and one-sample t tests (with the null hypothesis set to 0.50 or 50%) for preference strength (quantified as the proportion of time that the female spent in the non-neutral zone with the more ornamented male). Finally, Spearman correlations were used to assess the relationship between male ornamentation traits and each of the males’ sperm quality metrics (i.e. sperm velocity, longevity and density).

For the sperm competition trials, we examined the relationships between sperm quality metrics (velocity, longevity and density) and each male’s paternity share. We did not examine the relationships between paternity and male redness because spectral properties were not available for the males used in the in vitro sperm competition trials. We arbitrarily subtracted the percentage paternity and values of sperm quality (sperm velocity, longevity and density) of the male with the higher ID number (ID numbers were arbitrarily assigned based on the order in which males were collected) from that of the male with the lower ID number, resulting in relative measures of traits (e.g. differences in sperm velocity and differences in paternity). Because paternity estimates are more accurate when more offspring are examined (e.g. Neff & Pitcher 2002) and because the number of offspring to which we could assign paternity varied between pairs of males, the relationships with the differences in sperm traits and the differences in paternity were examined collectively using a weighted multiple linear regression (see Pitcher et al. 2003). Similar results were also found when the nonweighted regressions were used (data not shown).

RESULTS

There was no significant sexual dimorphism with respect to standard body length (\( F_{1.55} = 0.20, P = 0.66 \)), body mass (\( F_{1.55} = 0.13, P = 0.72 \)), condition factor (\( F_{1.55} = 1.70, P = 0.19 \)) or the hue of the red spawning coloration (\( F_{1.55} = 2.94, P = 0.09 \)) (see Table 1). By contrast, there was significant sexual dimorphism in the saturation (\( F_{1.55} = 8.35, P = 0.006 \)), brightness (\( F_{1.55} = 18.19, P < 0.001 \)) and the residual area (\( F_{1.55} = 18.55, P < 0.001 \)) of red spawning coloration, with males having larger values than females for saturation and residual area and lower values for brightness (i.e. males are ‘darker’ than females) (see Table 1).

During the dichotomous mate choice trials, females spent on average 73.7% of the time (on average 14.8 min of the 20 min trials, 51) for the nonneutral zone with the more ornamented male). Finally, we assayed whether females showed a preference for any of the significant sexually dimorphic traits using standard tests associated with dichotomous choice trials, binomials for the number of females that spent more time with the more ornamented male, and one-sample t tests (with the null hypothesis set to 0.50 or 50%) for preference strength (quantified as the proportion of time that the female spent in the non-neutral zone with the more ornamented male). Finally, Spearman correlations were used to assess the relationship between male ornamentation traits and each of the males’ sperm quality metrics (i.e. sperm velocity, longevity and density).

For the sperm competition trials, we examined the relationships between sperm quality metrics (velocity, longevity and density) and each male’s paternity share. We did not examine the relationships between paternity and male redness because spectral properties were not available for the males used in the in vitro sperm competition trials. We arbitrarily subtracted the percentage paternity and values of sperm quality (sperm velocity, longevity and density) of the male with the higher ID number (ID numbers were arbitrarily assigned based on the order in which males were collected) from that of the male with the lower ID number, resulting in relative measures of traits (e.g. differences in sperm velocity and differences in paternity). Because paternity estimates are more accurate when more offspring are examined (e.g. Neff & Pitcher 2002) and because the number of offspring to which we could assign paternity varied between pairs of males, the relationships with the differences in sperm traits and the differences in paternity were examined collectively using a weighted multiple linear regression (see Pitcher et al. 2003). Similar results were also found when the nonweighted regressions were used (data not shown).

During the dichotomous mate choice trials, females spent on average 73.7% of the time (on average 14.8 min of the 20 min behaviourial trial, range 4.8–19.9 min) associating with one of the two males (i.e. time spent in the preference zones). The preferences of focal females varied widely, ranging from some females preferring the more ornamented male to other females preferring the less ornate males. The number of females that spent more time with the

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Trait</th>
<th>Mean ± SD (range)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standard length (cm)</td>
<td>7.6 ± 0.3 (6.8–8.2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mass (g)</td>
<td>5.58 ± 0.64 (4.36–7.18)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Condition</td>
<td>1.28 ± 0.09 (1.15–1.53)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brightness (%)</td>
<td>19.1 ± 9.4 (6.7–56.9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saturation (%)</td>
<td>1.94 ± 0.67 (0.8–3.9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hue (nm)</td>
<td>598.1 ± 6.5 (585–616)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residual red spawning coloration area (%)</td>
<td>20.0 ± 2.0 (15–23)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Residual red spawning coloration area is shown here as a percentage of the body covered in red; however, in all analyses, we used residuals derived from the regression of area of red spawning coloration on overall body surface area (see text for details).
more ornamented male did not differ from chance for any of the
dimorphic traits examined (binomial tests: residual red spawning
coloration: 8/19, \(P = 0.14\); saturation: 13/19, \(P = 0.052\); brightness:
7/19, \(P = 0.10\)). In addition, females showed no significant prefer-
cence based on the proportion of association time for either the
more colourful male in the dichotomous choice test for any of the
dimorphic traits examined (one-sample \(t\) tests (null hypoth-
thesis = 50%): residual red coloration: mean = 0.51 ± 0.04, \(t_{18} = 0.23,\)
\(P = 0.82\); saturation: mean = 0.56 ± 0.04, \(t_{18} = 1.49,\) \(P = 0.15\); bright-
ness: mean = 0.51 ± 0.04, \(t_{18} = 0.23,\) \(P = 0.82\)). No significant
preferences (using binomial and one-sample \(t\) tests) were found for
traits that were not dimorphic (i.e. length, condition and hue), and
the preference-related results did not differ when we controlled for
body size (length) or condition (data not shown).

Residual red spawning coloration area among males was
significantly related to sperm velocity (\(r_S = 0.36, N = 45, P = 0.014\);
see Fig. 4) and marginally related to sperm density (\(r_S = 0.28,\)
\(N = 45, P = 0.06\)), but was not significantly related to sperm
longevity (\(r_S = 0.23, N = 45, P = 0.13\)). The hue, saturation and
brightness of male red spawning coloration was not significantly
related to sperm velocity (all \(P > 0.10\)), density (all \(P > 0.59\)) or
longevity (all \(P > 0.38\)). Results of correlations of male traits
(ornamentation and body size metrics) versus individual sperm
traits (path velocity, straight line velocity, point-to-point velocity,
longevity, density) are given in the Appendix (Table A1).

Multiple regression (all \(\beta\) values are standardized; overall
model: \(r^2 = 0.85, F_{2,8} = 9.49, P = 0.017\)) showed that the relative
sperm longevity (\(\beta = -0.18, P = 0.46\)) and relative sperm number
(\(\beta = 0.30, P = 0.19\)) were not significantly associated with sperm
competition success. However, relative sperm velocity was posi-
tively and significantly related to sperm competition success, as
measured by each male’s relative share of paternity in the in vitro
competitive fertilization trials (\(\beta = 0.69, P = 0.02\); Fig. 5).

**Table 2**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Trait</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Range</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Path velocity ((\mu m/s))</td>
<td>143.6</td>
<td>21.7</td>
<td>100–188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Straight line velocity ((\mu m/s))</td>
<td>95.4</td>
<td>29.7</td>
<td>12.8–172.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Point-to-point velocity ((\mu m/s))</td>
<td>165.3</td>
<td>17.7</td>
<td>129.7–196.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Longevity (s)</td>
<td>34.0</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>27–51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Density per ml ((\times 10^6))</td>
<td>11.1</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>4.4–21.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Using mate choice trials, spectral and sperm analyses and
paternity assignment, we found that red spawning coloration in
male redside dace is not subject to sexual selection arising from
prespawning female choice but is indirectly correlated with male–male postspawning competition. First, we documented
sexual dimorphism in the relative amount of red spawning color-
ation as well as the spectral properties (saturation and brightness)
of the red spawning coloration, with males being more ornamented
than females. Second, we found that females did not favour males
that had relatively larger red spawning coloration areas or
spawning coloration with longer wavelength hues. Third, we found
that males with relatively more red spawning area would likely be
favoured in male–male postspawning sperm competition because
they possessed sperm with higher velocity, and sperm velocity was
determined to be the key predictor of sperm competition success as
assessed by paternity in our in vitro sperm competition trials.

We documented sexual dimorphism in the saturation, bright-
ness and relative area of red spawning coloration, as well as a nearly
significant difference in hue, with males showing a greater degree of
trait elaboration. Our findings suggest that these traits are most
likely secondary sexual characters. However, we found no sexual
dimorphism in body size in redside dace, which is consistent with
Pyron’s (1996) phylogenetic examination of 58 species of North
American minnows. Pyron (1996) found that the main ecologically
relevant variable related to sexual size dimorphism was territory
guarding behaviour, a behaviour that does not appear to be present
in the redside dace mating system (T. E. Pitcher, personal
observation).

Females showed no behavioural preference for males with
relatively more red spawning coloration or spawning coloration
that was brighter, more saturated or had higher hue values. This
finding is in contrast to other mate choice studies on other
minnow species such as Phoxinus phoxinus, where females prefer more
colourful males (Kekalainen et al. 2010). The lack of female pref-
ence for red spawning coloration in redside dace may arise
because of differences in its mating system compared to other
minnow species. For example, redside dace males do not defend
a territory and do not display in leks, as do most other minnows
(see Pyron 1996). There is also the possibility that our female choice
data may describe association preference only, and not actual

**Figure 4.** Relationship between residual red spawning coloration area and sperm velocity in redside dace (see text for details).

**Figure 5.** Partial regression plot (based on multiple regression analysis, see text for details) showing the relationship between fitted partial residual differences in sperm velocity and differences in paternity in redside dace.
mating intent, but this seems unlikely for a variety of reasons. First, we performed the behavioural trials when males and females were spawning (individuals all possessed bright red spawning coloration and breeding tubercles), suggesting that mating was most likely a priority for both sexes at the time. Second, it has been shown in several fish species that a female’s visual response in dichotomous trials can be a good predictor of a male’s subsequent reproductive success (e.g. Kodric-Brown 1993; Walling et al. 2010). It is also possible that the statistical tests of the behavioural data did not have enough power to detect a relationship between male colouration metrics and female preference measures. However, our sample size ($N = 19$) was larger than that of another study of minnows ($N = 16$, Kekalainen et al. 2010) that also used dichotomous choice behavioural data and found that females spent significantly more time on the side of the more colourful (redder) males using both a binomial test and $t$ test.

We determined that sperm velocity was the primary determinant of sperm competition success in our competitive in vitro fertilization trials, such that males with faster sperm achieved higher levels of paternity than their competitors. Consistent with other studies (e.g. Gage et al. 2004; Linhart et al. 2005), this finding suggests that sperm competition in the redside dace mating system occurs as a loaded raffle (Parker 1990), where the quality, rather than simply the number, of each male’s sperm matters. Males with high-velocity sperm can have relatively higher paternity because their sperm will travel longer distances per unit time, and as such, will make more egg contacts per unit time (see Butts et al. 2009). Another reason sperm velocity is believed to be an important factor in teleost sperm competition success is the presence of a micropley for fertilization. Teleost sperm have no mechanism for penetrating the cell membrane directly and are therefore required to enter the egg by using a canal, the micropley, through the plasma membrane (Iwamatsu et al. 1991). In chum salmon, Oncorhynchus keta, it has been shown that the order of entry of sperm into the micropley is an important determinant of fertilization success (Kobayashi & Yamamoto 1981). Higher-velocity sperm most likely have a higher probability of reaching the micropley first, which is consistent with our findings. However, our paternity results need to be interpreted with some caution because the sperm from both males were applied in a controlled manner to the eggs (i.e. the position and timing were equalized), which is rarely the case in nature. During spawning, certain males are often able to position themselves closer to the female than others, and some may release sperm more quickly or in better synchrony with the timing of egg release (e.g. Stoltz & Neff 2006). For example, Yeates et al. (2007) showed that a delay of 2 s in releasing sperm reduces second-male fertilization success to 30% from an expected 50% in Atlantic salmon, Salmo salar. Therefore, future research should aim to observe spawning behaviour of redside dace, and replicate the position and timing effects observed in the wild in the laboratory to determine the relative importance of position, timing and sperm quality.

We found an indirect link between sperm competition success and male ornamentation: males in the experimental in vitro fertilization trials with faster sperm velocity were more likely to have a higher share of paternity and males from the field with more residual red spawning coloration area had sperm with higher velocity on average. We also found a marginally significant relationship between sperm density, which was not related to sperm competition success, and residual red spawning coloration area. However, the reason behind these associations between red spawning coloration and sperm-related traits remains unclear. There are several plausible explanations for this finding. First, the relative area of red spawning coloration in redside dace may be directly linked to carotenoid-based antioxidant resources that are presumed to affect sperm quality (reviewed in Blount et al. 2001). The red spawning coloration of the redside dace is composed of carotenoid pigments (T. E. Pitcher, unpublished data), which several studies have linked to sperm quality. For example, darker carotenoid coloration is related to higher sperm velocity in coho salmon, Oncorhynchus kisutch (Pitcher et al. 2009b), as well as mallards, Anas platyrhynchos (Peters et al. 2004). The most prevalent hypothesis linking carotenoid coloration to sperm quality involves the role of carotenoids as antioxidants in the body. Both sperm and secondary sexual characters may be vulnerable to oxidative damage from free radicals, while the organism can only draw from a limited pool of antioxidants to mitigate this damage. Blount et al. (2001) therefore suggested that males who have a carotenoid pool that allows them to present more colourful ornaments can also better protect their sperm from oxidative damage or mutation. Second, it is possible that there is a genetic correlation between the area of red spawning coloration and sperm quality traits. This relationship could arise if red spawning coloration and sperm velocity are both pleiotropic consequences of some shared underlying genes. The area of carotenoid-based sexual coloration in other fishes, for example guppies, is Y-linked (Houde 1992), and may therefore be associated with sperm-related genes (see Roldan & Gomendio 1999). Third, a link between sperm velocity and red spawning colouration area may also be mediated by genetic load arising from inbreeding depression; ornament size may be negatively correlated with inbreeding depression (e.g. van Oosterhout et al. 2003). Likewise, sperm traits have a genetic basis in many taxa (e.g. Woolley & Beaty 1967; Morrow & Gage 2001), and sperm abnormalities have often been associated with inbreeding depression (O’Brien et al. 1985; Wildt et al. 1987; Roldan et al. 1998; Gomendio et al. 2000; Margulis & Walsh 2002). Finally, it is also possible that some of the association between area of red spawning coloration and sperm velocity in redside dace is developmental. Differences in sperm number and quality have been found in relation to ontogeny in many taxa (e.g. Calvo et al. 1999; Ceballos-Vazquez et al. 2003; Green 2003), including fishes (e.g. Evans et al. 2002).

In conclusion, we combined several methods of measuring sexual selection in one mating system rather than the typical measure of either female choice or male–male competition. All of these methods consistently demonstrated that females do not appear to show preference for spectral properties or the amount of male ornamentation, and that male redside dace with relatively more ornamentation possess higher-velocity sperm on average, which in experimental competitive trials, was shown to be a primary determinant of sperm competition success. These results suggest that, in this mating system, selection arising from prespawning female choice does not appear to maintain male ornamentation and that postspawning selection via male–male competition is primarily determined by sperm velocity, which is correlated with the relative amount of red spawning coloration.

Acknowledgments

This research was funded by an Ontario Graduate Scholarship (OGS) to J.J.B., the Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada (NSERC) in the form of Discovery Grants and Research Tools and Instrumentation Grants, as well as grants awarded by the University of Windsor, to T.E.P., S.M.D. and D.D.H. We are grateful to Justin Abbott and Sara Davidson for assistance in the field, Courtney Beneteau for assistance in the laboratory, and Kenyon College and the Brown Family Environmental Research Center for laboratory space. Fish were collected with a permit (No. 10414282) issued by the Ohio Department of Natural Resources, and all research was approved by the institutional Animal Care Committee at the University of Windsor (AUPP 09-02) and thus
adheres to the animal use and care guidelines of the Canadian Council on Animal Care. We thank two anonymous referees, A. Fisk, D. Higgs, C. Wilson and A. Mokdad for their comments on the manuscript.

References
Appendix

Table A1
Correlation matrix for individual sperm-related metrics (including the three sperm velocity metrics used to create the principal component for sperm velocity, PC1) in relation to ornamentation and body size metrics in the redside dace (N = 45 in all cases)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sperm metrics</th>
<th>Ornamentation/body size metrics</th>
<th>Brightness</th>
<th>Saturation</th>
<th>Hue</th>
<th>Residual red area</th>
<th>Standard length</th>
<th>Mass</th>
<th>Condition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Path velocity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rS</td>
<td>0.08</td>
<td>0.30</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>0.31</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>p</td>
<td>0.60</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>0.72</td>
<td>0.03</td>
<td>0.42</td>
<td>0.23</td>
<td>0.76</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Straight line velocity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rS</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.46</td>
<td>-0.02</td>
<td>0.09</td>
<td>0.15</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>p</td>
<td>0.49</td>
<td>0.46</td>
<td>0.45</td>
<td>0.002</td>
<td>0.89</td>
<td>0.57</td>
<td>0.32</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Point-to-point velocity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rS</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td>0.03</td>
<td>0.15</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>-0.06</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>p</td>
<td>0.94</td>
<td>0.22</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td>0.34</td>
<td>0.28</td>
<td>0.30</td>
<td>0.69</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

See text for details regarding each variable.